



Report of the Fact Finding Mission Conducted in Ngorongoro Conservation Area

By Navaya James Ndaskoi

April 3, 2021

Contents

1. Background.....	3
2. Testimonies from Girls and Women	4
3. Causes of hunger and starvation in Ngorongoro	11
4. Effects of Hunger	13
5. Recommendations	14
6. Conclusions	16
Notes and References.....	17

1. Background

This is a report of the fact finding mission which took place in Ngorongoro Conservation Area from March 25, 2021 to April 3, 2021. The team was made up of a staff, a driver and two journalists. Interviews were held with selected and willing respondents (mostly women).

The Government of the United Republic of Tanzania has been arranging for departure of indigenous peoples from Ngorongoro in the name of wildlife preservation. The main strategy has been to starve the pastoralists in the hope that they will leave without force.

The plan took a new twist in 2019 when the Government announced the arrangement to evict well over 73,000 out of 93,000 Maasai, Barabaig and Hadza residents from the Ngorongoro. Thousands more Maasai will be evicted from the neighbouring wildlife semi-preserved areas namely Lake Natron, Mto-wa-Mbu and Loliondo Game Controlled Areas.

The reasons given to justify the seemingly inevitable removal is the allegedly deterioration and depletion of vegetation, wildlife and the landscape within the gigantic NCA.

In April 2020 the Minister for Natural Resources and Tourism, Dr. Hamisi Kigwangalla, instructed the ministerial taskforce assigned to review the Ngorongoro Conservation Area Multiple Land Use Model to ensure active participation of indigenous residents, namely the Maasai, the Barabaig and the Hadza, in the process that will see the area stretched from the current 8,100 km² to 12,404 km². The area will be stretched by annexing Loliondo, Mto-wa-Mbu and Lake Natron Game Controlled Areas. Only 20,000 indigenous residents will remain in the expanded NCA. The rest will have to vacate. Prior to this instruction the processes has been moving on completely ignoring the residents. At almost the final stage of the report was when the residents complained through the mass media. Following this discontent the minister told the taskforce to involve residents of Ngorongoro. Four handpicked community representatives join the taskforce. The taskforce side-lined them still almost instantly.

The fact finding mission aimed to look at the land rights of pastoralists in Ngorongoro Conservation Area with a particular focus on how the same causes hunger and starvation.

Journalists captured what the respondents have to say so far and brought this to public attention by broadcasting and publishing in newspapers even more stories. Even if the project is coming to its end the information gathered will be used in next advocacy campaigns.

2. Testimonies from Girls and Women

1. Mary Taretoi, Oloirobi Village

I was born here in Ngorongoro. A very beautiful land. In fact the Ngorongoro is Tanzania's most magnificent wildlife preserved area; a place of incomparable beauty. Tourists, the underdogs and the rich alike, come to Ngorongoro and they come with money.

However, the people of Ngorongoro are sadly facing acute hunger and starvation in the midst of plenty. Since agrarian farming was banned in 2008 we have been living miserable lives.

One may ask, "Since you are pastoralists why don't you depend entirely on livestock instead?" Well, livestock are equally banned like agrarian farming because they are not allowed to access pastures and water as well saltlicks in Ngorongoro. In 2016 the Prime Minister banned livestock from entering prime grassing areas like the Ngorongoro, Empakaai and Olmoti Craters, Olduvai Gorge, Lake Ndutu and Masek Basins as well as Northern Highlands Forest Reserve. It is like banning someone to access her bank account to buy food.

Apart from livestock keeping and farming we could live decent lives by be given a share of the riches accrued from the land of our ancestors but this is not done either. Where do you get food from if your hands are tied at the back? You and your family starve and die agonizingly.

Some women go to the forest to hew firewood which they sell. Others sell tobacco. Others still go to scavenge at maize grinding machines and in peoples' farms after harvest. This is how most people keep their soul and body together. The staple food eaten now days in most homes in Ngorongoro is porridge; a drink made up of boiled maize flour and water. This is consumed once per day. Most pastoralists of Ngorongoro do not afford square meals.

Women go as far away as Mbulu, Dongobesh, Manyara, Mto-wa-Mbu, Haydom, Katesh, Karatu and others distant places to find food. Some of them have been sexually abused in those foreign lands. Some have died away from home only for their bodies to be returned. Our brothers spent sleepless night guarding, like dogs, other people as they sleep at night. This is how most youths take care of their families. In every conceivable way we are living the most dehumanizing lives on Earth. The Government is systematically starving us.

The residents of Ngorongoro through the Ngorongoro Pastoralists Council used to get a fraction of money accrued from the land. The money is used to sponsor students from the area. This too was withdrawn last year and transferred to Ngorongoro District Council. Many students failed to go to school because of lack of money after the transfer of the funds.

2. Agnes Saruni, Olbalbal Village

Ngorongoro is a terrible place. We, the women, sell water in order to feed children. A 20 liters can fetches TSh500. This can hardly feed anybody. I hew and sell firewood to meet end needs. Livestock too are very bonny to sell because they are starving. Starved cows do not have milk. Livestock have been pushed literarily too far; between a rock and a hard place.

My children are like street children. They drink porridge once per day and it is the same every day. They cannot go to school because I cannot afford. I have no money to buy them school uniforms, pens and notebooks. And I am not alone. This is a story of most women in Ngorongoro. Many of us have moved to Karatu to scavenge in maize field during harvest.

I would like to ask the Government to stop squeezing life out of us because we are humans.

3. Noorkisaruni Rotiken, Alaililai Village

We, Ngorongoro residents, do not have food. We are permanently starving because of bad policies. Driven by hunger and poverty women and youths are leaving Ngorongoro because hunger is no longer bearable. In distant lands women and children are victimized by criminals. Some women have died of hunger. It is genocide against Ngorongoro pastoralists.

I ask the Government, specifically the President, to intervene without further delays.

4. Flora Oltumo, Misigiyo Village

Hunger is pushing people to vacate Ngorongoro which is in fact a place we call home. It is almost impossible to live in Ngorongoro. This is for everybody but especially women. Women carry a lot of burden since they are the ones responsible to provide the family. We and our children are starving. The Government banned livestock from accessing the gigantic Ngorongoro Crater. Before this ban we use to get milk. Some years ago President Benjamin William Mkapa of Tanzania allowed cultivation of gardens. This was banned in 2008. Now we are finished. Everybody is fleeing away from Ngorongoro. We are spreading all over

looking for ways to survive. During the last year harvesting season places like Nainokanoka were deserted as people move to Karatu and other districts to scavenge in harvested maize fields and bring whatever they get back home in Ngorongoro. They end-up in problems. Women died together with their children. Remember that we have useless political leaders.

Young men go away to look for jobs hoping to send something back home. The jobs they get are despicable. Some end up being employed as security guards and this is very risky. Some of them only return home in coffins. It is impossible for an outside to comprehend this.

If I were asked how to alleviate hunger in Ngorongoro I would mention three strategies. One the Government should allow us to farm like our forefathers did and their fathers and every person that have ever lived in Ngorongoro. Farming does not necessarily destroy the land.

Secondly, livestock should be allowed to access pastures, water and saltlicks. The livestock sector should be improved. Saltlicks in the Ngorongoro Crater was a catalyst for livestock to fatten and fetch good prices when sold. This too has changed since access to the crater was forbidden in December 2016. Livestock must flourish like wildlife in the area.

Thirdly, we are told that Ngorongoro is a World Heritage Site. That is fine; absolutely we have no quarrel with that. Tourists flock into Ngorongoro in hundreds of thousands every year. And every tourists is attached to dollars. The money is accrued from our ancestral land. Why are we not given a share of the income accrued from tourism business in our land? The Government should look at our suffering because we have had enough share of sorrow.

Ngorongoro is a beautiful place that attracts lots of peoples from around the world to come to see the landscape and the rich biological resources that we live with and they undoubtedly go home happy and refreshed. We, the people of Ngorongoro, deserve to be just as happy.

5. Moita Kuya Kirwa, Nainokanoka Village

About 12 years ago the Government banned cultivation of gardens in Ngorongoro. The ban triggered serious hunger and starvation among the people of Ngorongoro. We use to depend on cultivation of small gardens for food self-sufficiency. Given the ban those with some money go to neighboring districts to buy food. Others go beg for food while others scavenge in harvested corn fields. A very bad story. The food obtained in this way is not sufficient.

Most peoples cannot afford three meals a day and in most cases one type of food; porridge. Fruits, vegetables and other necessary foods cannot be found on the tables of most homes.

The people of Ngorongoro have been struggling against hunger and starvation. The struggle led to an initiative in which the Ngorongoro Administration bought food outside the area and availed it for the residents at reasonable prices. This was paralyzed by the unwillingness of preservationists working together with Government officials. This is not to say that the program was performing well. It had problems. Very little food, 20kg for example, was sold to each household without regard to the number of mouths to feed and worse it is brought every 3 months. This food itself could hardly last for a week. Which means peoples starve.

Food insecurity in Ngorongoro Conservation Area has caused a lot of problems. Women, especially pregnant and lactating, are poorly fed. The same is true about children and elderly people. This is in tens of thousands. It is a very hard situation. This is unacceptable.

Children lack many vitamins including Vitamin D and several minerals. Minerals like iron for pregnant women. Women fall sick often because of malnutrition as do children.

Pupils and students alike are dropping out of school because of poverty and hunger. The young men are deserting families and go to urban centers to look for food. Some of them cross international boundaries and travel as far as Nairobi in Kenya to do degrading jobs.

Food insecurity could be addressed by the Government improving transport infrastructure. There is almost no roads in Ngorongoro. In places where there are roads then they are in pathetic conditions; unpassable. So transporting food from outside the area is quite costly and its implications can be seen in high food prices because few traders would risk the poor roads. If there were good roads food could be transport at reasonable prices from Karatu, Monduli, Meatu, Mbulu, Arusha and elsewhere. In this way families could afford food.

Apart from roads the Government should also prepare a masters plan that addresses food insecurity. The Government collects lots of money from tourists coming here. If the benefits were shared with the rightful owners of the land there would be no hunger in Ngorongoro.

6. Naishi Olobulu, Kayapus Village

I am from Ngorongoro Conservation Area. There is hunger in the area. And this is for a very long time. The Government prohibited livestock from accessing pastures in many places in Ngorongoro. Livestock without food, water and saltlicks are like sacks of skeletons. They cannot produce milk. If slaughtered they are unpalatable. Selling them is not an option since they would not fetch good prices. So many people have lost their livestock over the decades.

As if that is not bad enough the Government has outlawed cultivation of even small gardens. We used to farm to get food. We used to farm and herd livestock; a blend for survival. We get almost nothing from the tourism and wildlife sectors. People are destitute in Ngorongoro.

The Government has wreaked havoc on us. It has caused suffering by every means of the word. We, the women, have no choices. We go to the bush to collect wild vegetables. We sell them so as to get money to buy food. And even then there is no food to buy in Ngorongoro.

Some of us travel to faraway places like Karatu to do very demeaning activities like washing dishes and some even beg for food. My son went to Kenya because hunger is intolerable here in Ngorongoro. Many youths escape from home like my son did. Some rarely return. Some get lost. Some are brought back in caskets. This is a very weird situation and it should not be the case. The Government does like to see us alive. It is systematically eliminating us.

7. Nemburis Eliya Kimirei, Irkeekpusi Village

There is hunger in Ngorongoro, serious hunger so to speak. People are dying because of hunger. Livestock are in pathetic conditions. You take them to the market most likely they return because you get very low prices. Potential buyers do not like the animals.

Therefore women like me go to Karatu. Karatu is a nearest town from Ngorongoro. We go there to look for food. Some of us to buy. Some others to wait for dog's food. Not long ago an expectant mother died together with her unborn twins because of hunger. She was too weak to deliver. In the process of taking her to Endulen Hospital she die. Another women and her two-year-old son were hit by a motorbike in Karatu and they died on the spot. They would not have died if there was food in Ngorongoro. Hunger pushed her and her child from the village where there is no traffic to worry about to a town called Karatu with lots of social evils including challenges of crossing busy and rough roads. Other children have died of cold. They and their mothers have no accommodation in towns. They sleep in the streets.

We request the Government to intervene because the suffering is worsening. Day by harsh day it is becoming almost impossible to live in Ngorongoro Conservation Area.

8. Naserian Taretoi, Mokilal Village

I am 70-year-old. I was born in what is now called Ngorongoro Conservation Area. My parents were born here too like their parents before and every person that have ever lived here. We, Ngorongoro residents, we call this place home. We are sentimentally attached to this land. We live with wildlife. This explains why there are rich biological resources in Ngorongoro. It is not a mere historical coincidence. Wildlife are here because of our culture.

The Tanzanian Government collects huge sums of money from the tourism sector in Ngorongoro than in any other tourist attraction in the country. Despite this fact, however, the residents are living in anguish. A 30-year-old women in Ngorongoro is so worn by hunger and poverty to an extent that she looks like a-70-year-old. Wildlife have proved to be a serious liability to us. The Government collects money and treats us like garbage.

The people of Ngorongoro are living like paupers. I have no words to explain the hardships. I have heard that in other places people eat three times per day. In Ngorongoro few would afford this. Cultivation has been prohibited. Livestock are denied pastures and water. So we beg for food from areas where they are allowed to produce food. Women and children sleep at Karatu bus station because they have no place to sleep once away from Ngorongoro.

We ask the newly sworn in President to help the pastoralists of Ngorongoro soon enough. We are being treated worse than beasts. We are humans and Tanzanians besides.

9. Ndetya Napir, Kayapus Village

I am a widow. My husband passed away and left me behind with two children. I struggled a lot to raise them despite all the odds. I sold water and firewood for the children to get primary education. Primary education does not make someone employable. The children still depend on me and I am poor. There is no food in Ngorongoro for them to eat. The people of Ngorongoro and especially women and children are suffering. Only a minority have livestock. Most do not. Those without cattle are really having hard times living in Ngorongoro. Even those with livestock are also in anguish. Cattle are deprived of pastures and water. They become too thin. They produce no milk at all given lack of pastures.

I came to Karatu to try to combat hunger in Ngorongoro, serious hunger so to speak. People are dying in Ngorongoro because of hunger. There are many women from Ngorongoro here in Karatu. In the past there used to be subsidized food but this too has been withdrawn. At the same time the Government prohibited cultivation. People could grow vegetables like cabbages but they are not allowed. Most people have no formal employment. It is like fixing two fingers up the noses of the people of Ngorongoro. The situation is so bad; like a funeral.

Children are fleeing to towns. They leave school because of hunger and poverty. They am to get jobs in towns. But who will employ an uneducated person? What are these young people expected to do? Mine looked at my face and saw that I am aging and he cannot help me. He then decide to go away rather than seeing me suffer while he cannot assist me. Some youths go away only to be brought back home dead. Today, as I speak, the body of a son of my neighbor who died in Mwanza is on the way to Ngorongoro for burial. The boys leave alive and return dead. I was with his grieving mother minutes ago here in Karatu consoling her. Young people from literarily have fled home because of hardships posed by conservation.

So really when we say that the situation in Ngorongoro is very bad it should not be hard to understand. The Government should find ways to arrest this hunger state in Ngorongoro.

Some of our relatives are killed by wild animals like buffalo, elephant and leopard as they collect firewood to sell so as to get money with which to buy food and other necessities. When the Government sees us alive it should know that we are living because we beg.

I heard that the President of Tanzania passed away. I also heard that he is replaced by a lady like me. I believe she, like all the mothers, do not like to see people and especially children suffer. May I ask her to address the horrendous lives that the Government is forcing upon us.

10. Emima Soine, Nainokanoka Village

We are an ill-fated people. The Government banned agriculture since 2008. So even if the people want to cultivate they cannot. Cattle production is in all times low. Restrictions have shaken cattle to an extent that they cannot produce milk and they cannot fetch good prices. So people are dying of poverty and starvation in an area where a lot of money is collected.

I, as a student and girl at that, am a victim myself. I passed my examination to go to high school. My parents though are too poor to send me to high school. And I know other girls and boys alike whose quest for education came to an abrupt end because of poverty.

People are leaving Ngorongoro to go to look for food elsewhere. It is a strategy of course of the Government to make life so hard hoping that people will leave out of frustration.

3. Causes of hunger and starvation in Ngorongoro

Twenty people including students studying in various secondary schools and colleges were asked what the causes of hunger in Ngorongoro are. Some answered face to face while others shared their responses through Whatsapp. Below is the summary of their responses;

1. Prohibition of agrarian farming. Food crops could be grown in most areas within the preserved area. Cereals, legumes and vegetables as well as bananas flourish in Ngorongoro and the people used to cultivate gardens for food self-sufficiency. Banning of agriculture is said to be responsible for abject poverty and hunger.
2. Restrictions of livestock to access pastures. Most respondents said that the Ngorongoro Administration prohibits livestock from accessing pastures, water and saltlicks. Examples were given like the visit by the Prime Minister of Tanzania to Ngorongoro and the banning of livestock from entering Ngorongoro, Olmoti and Empakaai Craters, Northern Highlands Forest Reserve and Lake Ndutu Basin. This means that livestock can only grass in marginal and small areas remaining. In effect the livestock industry is crushing at alarming rates with poor prices and little milk.
3. The Ngorongoro Administration is the main employer in the vicinity. The corporation however have a particular aversion for the residents. In 2020 it had over 700 employees. Residents it employed at that time amounted to less than ten percent of the laborers.
4. Denying the Ngorongoro pastoralists a rightful share of income accrued from their ancestral land. Ngorongoro Conservation Area is by far the leading tourist attraction in the country. The Government collects millions of US Dollars in the area annually. Literarily nothing is given to the community so that it could feed itself.

5. Lack of sustainable food security strategy and policy. The pastoralists have struggled in past decades to have a right for subsidized cereals. In 2016 however the Government arbitrarily discontinued the program without availing an alternative. This shot up food prices to an extent that only few residents can afford to buy food.
6. Illiteracy is very high among the residents of Ngorongoro. In 2017 the National Bureau of Statistics confirmed that over 60 percent of the residents do not know how to read and write. This means that only a fraction of residents is employable. In effect only few residents employed elsewhere can remit money home to feed relatives.
7. Poor roads. The transport infrastructure in the area is almost non-existent. In areas where there are roads then they have an appearance of having been bombed recently. This discourages food movement as business people fear breakdown of their Lorries.
8. Oppressive Ngorongoro Conservation Area Act. This law was said to restrict movement of people into and outside the area and effectively discouraging trade. Cars even owned by residents are charged park and parking fees. So few people owns cars.
9. Banning of motorbikes is also responsible for food insecurity. The motorbike business used to absorb many young people who get money and buy food for their families.
10. High camping fees. Most respondents explained that the Ngorongoro Administration charges \$60,000 for a campsite. This is too high price for the residents who would have wished to start camping as a way to get money so as to feed themselves.
11. Livestock predation. Predators like lions, leopards, hyenas, pythons, foxes and others eat livestock and the Government, the owner of wildlife, refuses categorically to pay compensation to the victims. This exposes the residents to hunger and starvation.
12. Poverty. In 2013, for the first time, the Government admitted, with a purpose, that indeed majority of the residents of Ngorongoro are poor. In 2017, the Government once again arrived at the same conclusion. In 2019 the Government, declared, "Human conditions are deteriorating in Ngorongoro." It then added, "The indicators of deteriorating human well-being in the area include poverty (50%), hunger (70%), illiteracy (64%) and diseases, among others."¹ Within seven years the Government, which normally denies poverty among its citizens, has systematically admitted that

there is poverty amongst the residents of the NCA in three different official reports. Poor people have nothing to sell and therefore they cannot buy food.

13. Prohibition of building permanent structures. The Government denies the residents to construct permanent houses despite the fact that there are many massive permanent tourist accommodation facilities in the area. The residents therefore have no houses to use as collateral to access credits at the banks and other financial institutions.
14. The resident pastoralists are prohibited from starting businesses like hardware and supermarkets. This would have empowered them to fight hunger and starvation.
15. Lack of livestock markets. There are no livestock markets in Ngorongoro. As a result a bull which could fetch good price to buy sufficient food to feed a family is sold at throw away price. This means that selling off livestock to buy food does not work.

4. Effects of Hunger

Respondents were asked to explain how hunger is affecting the pastoralists. Again many people answered this question. The following were their reactions;

1. Death. Many people were said to have died of hunger and starvation in Ngorongoro. Many people cannot afford food. This leads to weight loss, wasting away of the body tissue and eventual death. Examples were given of 12 children who succumbed to measles few years ago. The victims were allegedly exposed to the highly contagious killer virus. The children could not withstand the disease because they were malnourished and therefore too weak to fight for their dear lives. Other people were said to have died by fleeing hunger in the area only to be killed in road accidents.
2. Diseases. Many respondents mentioned malnutrition for example that it is a very serious problem amongst many children, expectant mothers and the elderly. Malnutrition also leads to other diseases caused by inadequate food and consumption of food without nutrients. Cases of stunted growth, eye problems, diabetes and heart disease were mentioned. A student studying medicine at university said that the pastoralists in Ngorongoro are afflicted by mainly the diseases caused by poverty.

3. Women and girls escape to nearby districts to look for demeaning jobs. Some of them have no place to sleep in the towns and in foreign villages. Others end-up in problems like being sexually assaulted. Others still struggling to survive get into prostitution.
4. Rural to urban migration. Most warriors run away from their families to towns like Karatu, Meatu, Arusha, Shinyanga, Mwanza, Mbulu, Nairobi, Kampala and Dar es Salaam looking for jobs. Most of them end up being watchmen to protect the rich. Some of them are killed by buglers in cities only to be returned homed in caskets.
5. Loss of manpower. As women and youths go away from Ngorongoro labor is drained. This means that the labor force is eroded as fewer people remain behind.
6. Transmission of deadly diseases. The migration of both young men and women is said to be responsible for the prevalence of killed diseases like HIV/AIDS and the like.
7. Rates of divorce are very high in Ngorongoro since a member of the family, in some cases a wife and in others a husband, abandon the family and go away. This results in social conflicts which end-up with divorce and children suffering psychosocially.
8. Stress. Stress is emotional feeling whereby people can be so frustrated due to hunger and hunger related ailments. It can temper with immune system and leads to heart problems. Many people are said to be too stressed due to lack of food.
9. Poor academic performance for children especially at primary and secondary schools.
10. Family abandonment. One spouse leaves the family home and relatives and moves away. There is a highly number of family desertion in Ngorongoro due to lack of food security. In some villages most women are away all the year round.

5. Recommendations

In every interview that was recorded the respondents were asked to suggest ways to alleviate hunger and starvation in the Ngorongoro. Below is the summary of recommendations.

- Criminals responsible for the suffering of the people of Ngorongoro should be removed from public office and legal actions be taken against them immediately.

- One of the major functions of the Ngorongoro Conservation Area Authority is “to safeguard and promote the interests of the Maasai citizens of the United Republic of Tanzania engaged in cattle ranching and dairy industry within the Conservation Area.” This clause should be implemented as neglecting it is causing suffering.
- Cultivation of gardens should be allowed in the area so as peoples can feed their own families. It is unfair that the pastoralists of Ngorongoro are living on their villages but their hands are literally tied at the back. The Government should allow farming.
- Livestock, like wildlife, should be allow to freely access pastures, water and saltlicks. This is because livestock and wildlife have shared these resources for centuries without negatively affecting the area. This is why it remains a leading tourist attraction in the country. Livestock should access the three craters, Northern Highlands Forest Reserve, Oldupai Gorge, Lake Ndutu Basin and Masek everglades.
- The Ngorongoro Administration should employ eligible residents to the extent of over 80 percent including in its decision making organs. Majority employees of the Maasai Mara National Reserve in Kenya are the residents Maasai. This did not stop the reserve to be the leading earner of tourism accrued money to the Kenyan Government.
- Ngorongoro Administration should give a share of income its collects to the rightful owners of the land. Most people suggested that in fact pastoralists should manage the area and pay taxes and other royalties to the treasury as a way to end poverty.
- Ngorongoro must have a food security strategy and policy. Money collected from tourism should be ploughed back to the residents in the shape of dividends.
- The Ngorongoro Administration used to give a fraction of money it collects to the Ngorongoro Pastoralists Council. The council has used the money to pay education costs for students studying at various institutions of learning. Last year, however, the Government transferred that money to the Ngorongoro District Council. The money should be returned so as the families can buy food while the NPC mind education.
- The Government should respect original promises at the start of Ngorongoro. The idea that conservation of the Ngorongoro area be built round the interests of its

inhabitants was made even clearer in a speech by the Governor to the Maasai Federal Council on August 27, 1959. The Governor spoke almost reassuringly:

Another matter which closely concerns the Masai [sic] is the new scheme for the protection of the Ngorongoro Crater. I should like to make it clear to you all that it is the intention of the Government to develop the Crater in the interests of the people who use it. At the same time the Government intends to protect the game animals of the area; **but should there be any conflict between the interests of the game and the human inhabitants, those of the latter must take precedence** [added emphasis].²

- The pastoralists of Ngorongoro should be allowed to enjoy their constitutional rights including the right to acquire and own property like decent houses. They should be let alone to construct as they so wish and start businesses in their ancestral lands.
- The Government must introduce compensation scheme for wildlife damages. This is both for human killed and those injured by wildlife as well as destruction of property.
- Livestock infrastructure like deeps and markets for livestock products such as milk, meat and others should be enhanced in Ngorongoro so as livestock can sustain lives.

6. Conclusions

The suffering of indigenous peoples in Ngorongoro is long overdue. It is time to take the advocacy for the betterment of the lives of Ngorongoro pastoralists to internationally levels.

The pastoralists of Ngorongoro have a vital role play in environmental management and development of the area because of their knowledge and traditional practices. The state should recognize and duly support their identity, culture and interests and enable their effective development as stated in the Rio Declaration on Environment and Development.

In a Government of laws, the existence of Government will be especially imperiled if it fails to observe the law scrupulously. If government becomes law breaker it breeds contempt for law, it invites every man to become a law unto himself (Justice Louis Brandies of the US Supreme Court, as quoted in the book *In search of Freedom and prosperity*, Claripress 1996).

The Maasai pastoral stewarded natural harmonious co-existence of the domestic and wild animals in holistic ecosystems, has been severely undermined and reduced by the

combination of shortsightedness and greed. Ecosystem fragmentation and cultural destruction driven policies, laws, practices and mismanagement to an endangered existence.

The act of tearing out swaths of ecosystems upsets the existing natural balance in ways that harm even portions not intended to be tempered with. The rich natural mosaic of authentic indigenous living culture, land tenure and biological diversity.

This is reckless development at work, destruction of the very long-term sustainable and valued habitats, biological diversity and culture, the protection and enhancement of which so many institutions and individuals have been proclaiming to be committed to.

The powers in the land and the wildlife preservation lobby have failed to recognize the values of the composite pastoral peoples' worldview, culture, and land tenure and biodiversity heritage. The crux of the matter is theirs and our worldviews and cultures are opposite poles. They care the least about the internationally valued culture and human rights of the natural conservators leave alone the pauperization plight. The Maasai worldview and culture contributions to the integrity of the existence of the massive wildlife population great biodiversity and the lucrative industry have officially persistently ignored and absurdly abused. For same primary reason, the beneficiaries of the fragmentation and looting enterprise trampling on the inalienable rights of the very natural conservators.

These natural conservators should at very least not be starved in the midst of plenty.

Notes and References

¹ MNRT, 2019.

² Grzimek, 1960: 246